Issues in Thinking about God

Michaelmas Term 2008

Johannes Zachhuber

http://users.ox.ac.uk/~trin1631

Week 6: God and Language

- J. Macquarrie, *God-Talk*, London 1967
- F. Kerr, *Theology after Wittgenstein*, Oxford 1986
- I. Ramsay, Religious Language, London 1957
 - J. Soskice, *Metaphor and religious language*, Oxford 1985

God and Language

- Not a new problem in theology:
- Patristic and medieval debates about the nature of God reflect on its linguistic side
- New impulse in 20th century due to prevalence of language as philosophical topic
- Convergence of interest in two different traditions: analytic philosophy and hermeneutics

Ludwig Wittgenstein (1898-1951)

- Fundamental is the perception that abuse of language causes pseudo-philosophy
- Immediate consequences for (traditional, metaphysical) theology
- Position of the *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*:
- Language can only express empirical facts; logical propositions are tautological.

Wittgenstein II

- There are, indeed, things that cannot be put into words. They make themselves manifest. They are what is mystical (Tractatus 6.522).
- Similar to Kant's position: critique of truth-claims leaves void that can be filled by religion.
- Extreme version of negative theology:
- What we cannot speak about we must pass over in silence (Tractatus 7).

Wittgenstein III

- Wittgenstein's later philosophy starts from ordinary language.
- Philosophical Investigations (1953)
- The meaning of a word is its use in a language.
- Language is one with human practice
- Model of 'language-games'.

Consequences for theology

- Critique of 'nonsensical' metaphysical propositions applies to traditional doctrine of God.
- Possibility of understanding religion as a language-game: non-realistic version of theology:
- George Lindbeck, The Nature of Doctrine, London 1984

George Lindbeck

- Truth of doctrine is neither propositional nor subjective.
- It rests in the communal rules of discourse accepted by a church.
- Theology is thus 'grammar of faith'.
- Attractive as a response to modern challenges, but can theology do without realism?

Hermeneutics and Language

- Since the early 19th century hermeneutics was transformed from an applied into a foundational discipline.
- 'Understanding' was increasingly seen as tantamount to human interaction with the world.
- Language became interesting insofar as it enabled understanding.

Metaphor and Parables

- Traditional view (Aristotle):
- Metaphors are figures of speech
- They don't add to meaning, embellish expression.
- Through a tertium comparationis predicates are transferred (metapherein) from one object to another

Paul Ricoeur (1913-2005)

- The Rule of Metaphor. Creation of Meaning in Language, London 2003
- How do we understand a text?
- Meaning could be in the text or behind it.
- Yet Ricoeur suggests it is constituted before the text.
- Interaction between text and reader creates a 'text-world' inviting and challenging the reader.

Ricoeur II

- Text creates new reality
- Transformation of reader is crucially involved
- Metaphor is a tool for the generation of new being involving a text and a recipient.
- Jesus therefore had to use metaphor to reveal through language the new world of the Kingdom of God.

Eberhard Jüngel (*1933)

- God as the Mystery of the World, Edinburgh 1983
- Metaphysical notion of God led to his 'unspeakability' and thus to his disappearance in the modern world.
- Correcting the former may help alleviating the latter.

Jüngel II

- God is creative possibility, not latent actuality
- Jesus was sent as the Word of God to bring God to language.
- Parables through metaphor create new reality.
- The problem of negative theology is overcome in the Incarnation.

Jüngel III

- The revealed God is to be found in the world
- Opposite conclusion to early Wittgenstein: rejection of negative theology.
- How can it avoid 'liberal' identification of God and world?
- Will need notion of 'mysterious' and transcendent God as corrective.